



IS THIS AN AUTOMATIC REVIEW OR APPEAL OR BOTH Automatic Review

CHECK THE APPELLANT (party who filed the appeal)

<input type="checkbox"/>	Disciplined Party	Samir Zeine	ACBL #	P482183	Disciplined Party		ACBL #	
<input type="checkbox"/>	Charging Party	Joseph Jones	ACBL #	5399696	Location of Hearing	Web-Conference using Zoom		
Appellate Body		Appeals and Charges Committee			Date of Hearing	01/18/2021		
Original Disciplinary Body		Online Ethical Oversight Committee			Date of Hearing	12/15/2020		
Original Complainant		Robb Gordon	ACBL #	K652927	Effective date of the CDR consulted		August 15, 2020	

DISCIPLINE BEING APPEALED OR REVIEWED

Disciplined Party	Discipline	Beginning Date	Ending Date
Samir Zeine	Suspension	12/26/2020	06/25/2022
	Probation	06/26/2022	12/25/2022
	Member Not in Good Standing	12/26/2020	12/25/2022
	Removal of all MPs earned in BBO sessions played with "zak10"		

Additional comments or description regarding discipline being appealed or reviewed

The Disciplined Party was found responsible of violating CDR 3.20 by the OEOC. The offense cited by the OEOC panel was E19 Cheating and other Ethical Violations not specifically cited by other sections of this Appendix (CDR 3.20).

BASIS FOR APPEAL (skip this section if this is an Automatic Review)

<input type="checkbox"/>	Decision not supported by the weight of evidence.
<input type="checkbox"/>	Procedures were inconsistent with CDR which affected the substantial rights of Appellant or undermined the confidence in the integrity or fairness of the disciplinary process.
<input type="checkbox"/>	Discipline inappropriate.
<input type="checkbox"/>	One or more person(s) on the hearing panel had bias (objection to such bias was raised at the hearing).

COMMITTEE MEMBERS WHO REVIEWED THE MATTER OR HEARD THE APPEAL

Name	ACBL #	Name	ACBL #
A.J. Stephani, Chairman	Q368694	Jeff Overby	O879926
Dennis Carman	O828450	Laurie Rowe	P508832
Margot Hennings	N242118	Tim White	M029585
Deana Liddy	P205082		

ALSO PRESENT (include web-conference (WC), in person (P), telephonic (TP), etc. and include their capacity as witness, expert, etc.)

Name	ACBL #	Via	Capacity	Name	ACBL #	Via	Capacity
Ryan Connors	Q758913	WC	Charging P Co-Adv				
Linda Dunn	P197314	WC	In-House Counsel				
Robb Gordon	K652927	WC	Charging P Co-Adv				
Samir Zeine	P482183	WC	Disciplined Party				

ARGUMENTS PRESENTED (summary of arguments presented by the Disciplined Party and Charging Party, including testimony)

The Charging Party's Advocate argued that (1) the procedures followed by the OEOC panel was in accordance with the CDR; (2) the decision and discipline imposed by the OEOC panel was supported by the evidence; (3) a fair hearing was conducted; and the discipline imposed was commensurate with the findings of the panel. The Advocate reviewed several hands demonstrating that the Charged Parties make questionable penalty doubles, competitive bids, and opening leads not supported by bridge logic.

Mr. Zeine argued that, although he took actions consistent with a player with vastly more experience than his partner, they did not constitute evidence of collusive cheating. Mr. Zeine argued that he had no motive to cheat and that he wouldn't cheat at a game he loves.

COMMITTEE FINDINGS OF FACT (based on the evidence, state the committee's conclusion as to what happened)

The Committee believed that, given the scope of its review, the findings of the OEOC Panel should be upheld.

DECISION OF APPELLATE COMMITTEE

<input type="checkbox"/>	Remanded for rehearing	Disciplinary Body expected to rehear.	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Decision of the original hearing committee is upheld.		
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Decision of the original hearing committee is amended as described below:		
	Discipline	Beginning	Ending
<input type="checkbox"/>	Reprimand	N/A	N/A
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Probation	12/12/2021	06/11/2022
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Suspension	06/12/2020	12/11/2021
<input type="checkbox"/>	Other	N/A	N/A
Please describe other decision below:			
Suspension is back-dated to the date of Mr. Zeine's suspension from BBO.			

RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED (CHAIRMAN)

/s/ A.J. Stephani		Date:	1/18/21
Electronic Signature (type name above)	Wet Signature (sign above)		