



**IS THIS AN AUTOMATIC REVIEW OR APPEAL OR BOTH** Automatic Review

**CHECK THE APPELLANT** (party who filed the appeal)

<input type="checkbox"/>	Disciplined Party	J Wilmer Winsor	ACBL #	L287335	Disciplined Party	Shiree Shafrir	ACBL #	Q768730
<input type="checkbox"/>	Charging Party	Paul Cuneo	ACBL #	M499891	Location of Hearing	Web-Conference using Zoom		
Appellate Body		Appeals and Charges Committee				Date of Hearing	9/3/2023	
Original Disciplinary Body		Online Ethical Oversight Committee				Date of Hearing	2/27/2023	
Original Complainant		Jeff Edelstein	ACBL #	O200338	Effective date of the CDR consulted		August 1, 2021	

**DISCIPLINE BEING APPEALED OR REVIEWED**

Disciplined Party	Discipline	Beginning Date	Ending Date
	Suspension, 3 years	4/3/2023	4/2/2026
	Probation, 3 years	4/3/2026	4/2/2029
	Excluded from playing together in ACBL sanctioned games	4/3/2026	4/3/2029
	Forfeiture of 50% of total Masterpoints		
<b>Additional comments or description regarding discipline being appealed or reviewed</b>			
Members Not in Good Standing			

**BASIS FOR APPEAL** (skip this section if this is an Automatic Review)

<input type="checkbox"/>	Decision not supported by the weight of evidence.
<input type="checkbox"/>	Procedures were inconsistent with CDR which affected the substantial rights of Appellant or undermined the confidence in the integrity or fairness of the disciplinary process.
<input type="checkbox"/>	Discipline inappropriate.
<input type="checkbox"/>	One or more person(s) on the hearing panel had bias (objection to such bias was raised at the hearing).

**COMMITTEE MEMBERS WHO REVIEWED THE MATTER OR HEARD THE APPEAL**

Name	ACBL #	Name	ACBL #
Tim White, Chairman	M029585	Georgia Heth	N638399
Dennis Carman	O828450	Larry Sealy	P541643
Deana Liddy	P205082		

**ALSO PRESENT** (include web-conference (WC), in person (P), telephonic (TP), etc. and include their capacity as witness, expert, etc.)

Name	ACBL #	Via	Capacity	Name	ACBL#	Via	Capacity
Jeff Edelstein	O200338	WC	CoAdv-Charging P				
Justin Coniglio	Q809461	WC	CoAdv-Charging P				
J Wilmer Winsor	L287335	WC	Charged Party				

N/A

**COMMITTEE FINDINGS OF FACT** (based on the evidence, state the committee’s conclusion as to what happened)

In the Matter of Shiree Shafir and J Wilmer Winsor, the Committee upheld the finding of the OEOC Panel that they violated CDR 301(A)(2) Collusive Cheating: Online (CDR effective August 1, 2021).

The Committee reviewed the following discipline assessed by the OEOC panel: 3 years suspension, followed by 3 years probation during which they are excluded from playing with one another in ACBL sanctioned games, and forfeiture of 50% of total Masterpoints®. The parties will be Members Not in Good Standing for the duration of their discipline.

The Committee modifies the discipline imposed as follows based on its consideration of CDR 402(A) Primary Considerations, CDR 402(B) Secondary Considerations and proportionality and consistency among cases: 2 years suspension, followed by 3 years probation during which they are excluded from playing with one another in ACBL sanctioned games, and forfeiture of 25% of total Masterpoints®. The parties will be Members Not in Good Standing for the duration of their discipline.

**DECISION OF APPELLATE COMMITTEE**

<input type="checkbox"/>	Remanded for rehearing	Disciplinary Body expected to rehear.	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Decision of the original hearing committee is upheld.		
<input type="checkbox"/>	Decision of the original hearing committee is amended as described below:		
	<b>Discipline</b>	<b>Beginning</b>	<b>Ending</b>
<input type="checkbox"/>	Reprimand	N/A	N/A
<input type="checkbox"/>	Probation	4/3/2025	4/2/2028
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Suspension	4/3/2023	4/2/2025
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Other	N/A	N/A
	<b>Please describe other decision below:</b>		
	The Committee modifies the discipline imposed as follows based on its consideration of CDR 402(A) Primary Considerations, CDR 402(B) Secondary Considerations and proportionality and consistency among cases: 2 years suspension, followed by 3 years probation during which they are excluded from playing with one another in ACBL sanctioned games, and forfeiture of 25% of total Masterpoints®. The parties will be Members Not in Good Standing for the duration of their discipline.		

**RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED (CHAIRMAN)**

/s/ Tim White		Date:	9/5/2023
Electronic Signature (type name above)	Wet Signature (sign above)		