



**IS THIS AN AUTOMATIC REVIEW OR APPEAL OR BOTH** Automatic Review

**CHECK THE APPELLANT** (party who filed the appeal)

<input type="checkbox"/>	Disciplined Party	Tom Meloney	ACBL #	P788797	Disciplined Party	Ellen Tobin	ACBL #	N958008
<input type="checkbox"/>	Charging Party	Paul Cuneo	ACBL #	M499891	Location of Hearing	Web-Conference using Zoom		
Appellate Body		Appeals and Charges Committee				Date of Hearing	9/29/2023	
Original Disciplinary Body		Online Ethical Oversight Committee				Date of Hearing	4/27/2023	
Original Complainant		Jeff Edelstein	ACBL #	O200338	Effective date of the CDR consulted		August 15, 2020	

**DISCIPLINE BEING APPEALED OR REVIEWED**

Disciplined Party	Discipline	Beginning Date	Ending Date
	Suspension, 2 years	8/22/2023	8/21/2025
	Probation, 2 years	8/22/2025	8/21/2027
	Members not in good standing	8/22/2023	8/21/2027
	Forfeiture of 25% of total Masterpoints.		
<b>Additional comments or description regarding discipline being appealed or reviewed</b>			
Members Not in Good Standing.			

**BASIS FOR APPEAL** (skip this section if this is an Automatic Review)

<input type="checkbox"/>	Decision not supported by the weight of evidence.
<input type="checkbox"/>	Procedures were inconsistent with CDR which affected the substantial rights of Appellant or undermined the confidence in the integrity or fairness of the disciplinary process.
<input type="checkbox"/>	Discipline inappropriate.
<input type="checkbox"/>	One or more person(s) on the hearing panel had bias (objection to such bias was raised at the hearing).

**COMMITTEE MEMBERS WHO REVIEWED THE MATTER OR HEARD THE APPEAL**

Name	ACBL #	Name	ACBL #
Tim White, Chairman	M029585	Georgia Heth	N638399
Dennis Carman	O828450	Larry Sealy	P541643
Deana Liddy	P205082		

**ALSO PRESENT** (include web-conference (WC), in person (P), telephonic (TP), etc. and include their capacity as witness, expert, etc.)

Name	ACBL #	Via	Capacity	Name	ACBL#	Via	Capacity
Jeff Edelstein	O200338	WC	CoAdv-Charging P	McKenzie Myers	Q79902	WC	Observer
Justin Coniglio	Q809461	WC	CoAdv-Charging P				
Tom Meloney	P788797	WC	Charged Party				
Ellen Tobin	N958008	WC	Charged Party				
Wally Marcin	J494244	WC	Adv Charged P				

N/A

**COMMITTEE FINDINGS OF FACT** (based on the evidence, state the committee’s conclusion as to what happened)

In the Matter of Tom Meleney and Ellen Tobin, the Committee upheld the finding of the OEOC Panel that they violated CDR 301(A)(2) Collusive Cheating: Other (CDR effective August 15, 2020).

In the course of the Matter, questions arose concerning ACBL’s adherence to certain procedures specified in the CDR. The Committee investigated the relevant circumstances, reviewed the relevant CDR provisions, and discussed and considered the questions raised. The Committee determined there were not procedural irregularities that affected the substantive rights of the parties or that required any action by this Committee.

The Committee modified the period of suspension, otherwise upholding the discipline imposed by the OEOC Panel. Accordingly, Mr. Meleney and Ms. Tobin will each be suspended for a period of 18 months beginning August 22, 2023. Each will serve a period of two years probation following their suspension. Each will forfeit 25% of their total Masterpoint® holding. They will be members “Not in Good Standing” during the period of their discipline.

**DECISION OF APPELLATE COMMITTEE**

<input type="checkbox"/>	Remanded for rehearing	Disciplinary Body expected to rehear.	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Decision of the original hearing committee is upheld.		
<input type="checkbox"/>	Decision of the original hearing committee is amended as described below:		
	<b>Discipline</b>	<b>Beginning</b>	<b>Ending</b>
<input type="checkbox"/>	Reprimand	N/A	N/A
<input type="checkbox"/>	Probation	2/22/2025	2/21/2027
			Probation dates modified based on the Suspension modification.
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Suspension	8/22/2023	2/21/2025
			Suspension reduced to 18 mos.
<input type="checkbox"/>	Other	N/A	N/A
			<b>Please describe other decision below:</b>
<p>The Committee modified the period of suspension, otherwise upholding the discipline imposed by the OEOC Panel. Accordingly, Mr. Meleney and Ms. Tobin will each be suspended for a period of 18 months beginning August 22, 2023. Each will serve a period of two years probation following their suspension. Each will forfeit 25% of their total Masterpoint® holding. They will be members “Not in Good Standing” during the period of their discipline.</p>			

**RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED (CHAIRMAN)**

/s/ Tim White		Date:	10/5/2023
Electronic Signature (type name above)	Wet Signature (sign above)		