



**IS THIS AN AUTOMATIC REVIEW OR APPEAL OR BOTH** Automatic Review

**CHECK THE APPELLANT** (party who filed the appeal)

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Disciplined Party	Lucie McCartney	ACBL #	8244901	Disciplined Party		ACBL #	
<input type="checkbox"/>	Charging Party	Paul Cuneo	ACBL #	M499891	Location of Hearing	Web-Conference using Zoom		
Appellate Body		Appeals and Charges Committee			Date of Hearing	12/21/2022		
Original Disciplinary Body		Online Ethical Oversight Committee			Date of Hearing	9/10/2022		
Original Complainant		Jeff Edelstein	ACBL #	O200338	Effective date of the CDR consulted		August 1, 2021	

**DISCIPLINE BEING APPEALED OR REVIEWED**

Disciplined Party	Discipline	Beginning Date	Ending Date
	Suspension, 3 years	10/8/2022	10/7/2025
	Probation, 2 years	10/8/2025	10/7/2027
	Excluded from playing with Brian McCartney in ACBL sanctioned events	10/8/2025	10/7/2027
	Probation, 10 years	11/21/2024	11/20/2034
<b>Additional comments or description regarding discipline being appealed or reviewed</b>			
Forfeiture of all Masterpoints earned while playing together online with Brian McCartney.			

**BASIS FOR APPEAL** (skip this section if this is an Automatic Review)

<input type="checkbox"/>	Decision not supported by the weight of evidence.
<input type="checkbox"/>	Procedures were inconsistent with CDR which affected the substantial rights of Appellant or undermined the confidence in the integrity or fairness of the disciplinary process.
<input type="checkbox"/>	Discipline inappropriate.
<input type="checkbox"/>	One or more person(s) on the hearing panel had bias (objection to such bias was raised at the hearing).

**COMMITTEE MEMBERS WHO REVIEWED THE MATTER OR HEARD THE APPEAL**

Name	ACBL #	Name	ACBL #
Tim White, Chairman	M029585	Georgia Heth	N638399
Dennis Carman	O828450	Laurie Rowe	P508832
Deana Liddy	P205082	Larry Sealy	P541643

**ALSO PRESENT** (include web-conference (WC), in person (P), telephonic (TP), etc. and include their capacity as witness, expert, etc.)

Name	ACBL #	Via	Capacity	Name	ACBL #	Via	Capacity
Justin Coniglio	Q809461	WC	CoAdv-Charging P				
Martin Hirshman	J925369	WC	CoAdv-Charging P				
Lucie McCartney	8244901	WC	Charged Party				
Tom Thompson	2674750	WC	Adv-Charged P				
Jeff Edelstein	O200338	WC	Nat. Recorder				

N/A

**COMMITTEE FINDINGS OF FACT** (based on the evidence, state the committee’s conclusion as to what happened)

In the Matter of Lucie McCartney, the Committee upheld the finding of the OEOC Panel that she violated CDR 301(A)(2) Collusive Cheating Online. The Committee found that there were sufficient mitigating circumstances, not known to the OEOC, to modify the penalty imposed by the OEOC. Accordingly, Mrs. McCartney will be suspended for one year effective October 8, 2022, to be followed by two years probation. Circumstances have rendered immaterial any exclusion from playing with Brian McCartney. Mrs. McCartney will be a member “Not in Good Standing” during the probationary period. She will forfeit 30% of her current Masterpoint total.

**DECISION OF APPELLATE COMMITTEE**

<input type="checkbox"/>	Remanded for rehearing	Disciplinary Body expected to rehear.	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Decision of the original hearing committee is upheld.		
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Decision of the original hearing committee is amended as described below:		
	<b>Discipline</b>	<b>Beginning</b>	<b>Ending</b>
<input type="checkbox"/>	Reprimand	N/A	N/A
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Probation	10/8/2023	10/7/2025
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Suspension	10/8/2022	10/7/2023
<input type="checkbox"/>	Other	N/A	N/A
	<b>Please describe other decision below:</b>		
	Mrs. McCartney will be a member “Not in Good Standing” during the probationary period. She will forfeit 30% of her current Masterpoint total.		

**RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED (CHAIRMAN)**

/s/ Tim White		Date:	12/25/2022
Electronic Signature (type name above)	Wet Signature (sign above)		