



Charged Party(ies)	Patrick Maloney Carol O'Brien	ACBL #	8272107 7845901	Hearing Date	NR review 1/16/2023
Disciplinary Body	Appeals and Charges Committee	Hearing Location	Web conference using Zoom		
Charging Party	Paul Cuneo	ACBL#	M499891	Complainant	Jeff Edelstein ACBL# O200338

**COMMITTEE MEMBERS WHO HEARD THE CHARGES**

Name	ACBL #	Name	ACBL #
Tim White, Chairman	M029585	Georgia Heth	N638399
Dennis Carman	O828450	Larry Sealy	P541643
Deana Liddy	P205082		

**INDIVIDUALS THAT PARTICIPATED IN THE HEARING** (excluding committee members)

Name	ACBL#	Via	Capacity	Name	ACBL#	Via	Capacity
Jeff Edelstein	O200338	web conf.	Adv-Charging P			Select One	Select One
Justin Coniglio	Q809461	web conf.	Adv-Charging P			Select One	Select One
		Select One	Select One			Select One	Select One
		Select One	Select One			Select One	Select One

**EVIDENCE AND ARGUMENTS PRESENTED** (Summarize evidence and arguments presented including testimony. If additional space is needed, continue on page 3 of this hearing report.) (Note: provide new documentary evidence introduced during the hearing to the Office of National Recorder)

A Negotiated Resolution packet was provided to the Committee by the Compliance Coordinator. It contained Procedural Summary, Factors Considered by the Charging Party, Negotiated Resolutions, Membership Profiles, Recorder Complaint and Charge Letter.

The Negotiated Resolutions included statements from each party. Mr. Maloney stated: "I exchanged information with my partner about our hands during ACBL sanctioned games while playing online. I am sorry for my actions." Ms. O'Brien stated: "I exchanged information with my partner about our hands during ACBL sanctioned games while playing online. I am sorry for my actions."

**COMMITTEE FINDINGS OF FACT** (based on the evidence, state the committee's conclusion as to what happened)

In the Matter of Patrick Maloney and Carol O'Brien, the Committee approved the Negotiated Resolution entered into by the parties and ACBL Management in which Mr. Maloney and O'Brien admitted to a violation of CDR 301(A)(2) Collusive Cheating: Online. They each agreed to a penalty of 6 months suspension to start on December 1, 2022, 2 years probation during which they are prohibited from playing with each other online, and forfeiture of 20% of their current Masterpoint total.

**DECISION** (click on the box next to Not Responsible or Responsible of violating the CDR to add a check mark.)

Not Responsible

Responsible

**CDR GROUNDS FOR DISCIPLINE** Type the section(s) and description(s) found in CDR 3 which led to the discipline).

301(A)(2) Collusive Cheating: Online. "Online Collusive Cheating" is the exchange or transmission of information between two or more people, at least one of whom is a contestant in an online bridge competition, in any manner not expressly permitted by Law 73. The information need not be actually used by a player to prove a Violation under this section. This section includes agreements made by persons who are not partners or contestants, including, but not limited to kibitzers or teammates.

**DISCIPLINE** (Unless a discipline begins immediately, which requires you to complete a Notice of Immediate Discipline, all begin dates should start at least five days after you submit this hearing Report to the Office of National Recorder.

**Disciplined Party is convicted of premeditated or collusive cheating (or has admitted to such action), CDR 4.1.8 (a)** YES  NO

If yes, all masterpoints, titles and ACBL status ranks and other ACBL related awards earned by the disciplined party will be forfeited. These penalties also apply to the teammates and partners while playing with the disciplined party during the seven years preceding the date the Charges were brought through and including the date of this final decision.

	Start Date	End Date	Additional Requirements/Comments
<input type="checkbox"/> REPRIMAND		N/A	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> PROBATION	6/1/2023	5/31/2025	2 years; Excluded from playing with each other online during probationary period.
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> SUSPENSION	12/1/2022	5/31/2023	6 months

Is the disciplined party Suspended because of an Ethical Violation (CDR 4.1.8 (b))? YES  NO

If yes, the masterpoints and titles won in the event by the disciplined party, partners and teammates in which the offense occurred will be forfeited.

Is the Suspension imposed due to an Ethical Violation more than one year (CDR 4.1.8 (b))? YES  NO

If yes, the MPs, titles or other ACBL related award earned by the discipline party within twelve months preceding the date of the offense will be forfeited.

EXPULSION  N/A

SUSPENDED SENTENCE (only used in conjunction with an imposed Suspension from above that you have converted to Probation). State the condition of the sentence below

EXCLUSION from Events and Programs (list the exclusions and the dates of the events or activities). CDR 4.1.6

REDUCTION OR FORFEITURE of Masterpoints (MP) or Tournament Rank or Disqualification.

Forfeiture of 20% total Masterpoints.

**STATE THE OFFENSE(S) FROM APPENDIX B, CHART 1 and/or CHART 2 OF THE CDR**

N/A

The discipline imposed above is **SELECT** the recommended guidelines of Appendix B, Chart 1 and/or Chart 2.

If it is **OUTSIDE** the guidelines, a reason must be stated below.

**RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED (CHAIR)**

/s/ Tim White

Date: 1/19/23

Electronic Signature (type name above)

Wet Signature (sign above)