



IS THIS AN AUTOMATIC REVIEW OR APPEAL OR BOTH Automatic Review

CHECK THE APPELLANT (party who filed the appeal)

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Disciplined Party	Hansa Haria	ACBL #	5181623	Disciplined Party	Sobhagchand Haria	ACBL #	5181151
<input type="checkbox"/>	Charging Party	Paul Cuneo	ACBL #	M499891	Location of Hearing	Web-Conference using Zoom		
Appellate Body		Appeals and Charges Committee				Date of Hearing	2/21/2023	
Original Disciplinary Body		Online Ethical Oversight Committee				Date of Hearing	12/14/2022	
Original Complainant		Jeff Edelstein	ACBL #	O200338	Effective date of the CDR consulted		August 1, 2021	

DISCIPLINE BEING APPEALED OR REVIEWED

Disciplined Party	Discipline	Beginning Date	Ending Date
	Suspension, 2 years	1/9/2023	1/8/2025
	Probation, 3 years	1/9/2025	1/8/2028
	Excluded from playing together in ACBL sanctioned events	1/9/2025	1/8/2028
	Forfeiture of 50% of total Masterpoints.		

Additional comments or description regarding discipline being appealed or reviewed

Members Not in Good Standing during probationary period.

BASIS FOR APPEAL (skip this section if this is an Automatic Review)

<input type="checkbox"/>	Decision not supported by the weight of evidence.
<input type="checkbox"/>	Procedures were inconsistent with CDR which affected the substantial rights of Appellant or undermined the confidence in the integrity or fairness of the disciplinary process.
<input type="checkbox"/>	Discipline inappropriate.
<input type="checkbox"/>	One or more person(s) on the hearing panel had bias (objection to such bias was raised at the hearing).

COMMITTEE MEMBERS WHO REVIEWED THE MATTER OR HEARD THE APPEAL

Name	ACBL #	Name	ACBL #
Tim White, Chairman	M029585	Georgia Heth	N638399
Dennis Carman	O828450	Larry Sealy	P541643
Deana Liddy	P205082		

ALSO PRESENT (include web-conference (WC), in person (P), telephonic (TP), etc. and include their capacity as witness, expert, etc.)

Name	ACBL #	Via	Capacity	Name	ACBL#	Via	Capacity
Jeff Edelstein	O200338	WC	CoAdv-Charging P				
Justin Coniglio	Q809461	WC	CoAdv-Charging P				

N/A

COMMITTEE FINDINGS OF FACT (based on the evidence, state the committee’s conclusion as to what happened)

In the Matter of Hansa and Sobhagchand Haria, the Committee upheld the finding of the OEOC Panel that they violated CDR 301(A)(2) Collusive Cheating: Online. It also upheld the two-year suspensions, the three-year probations during which the parties are excluded from playing with one another in ACBL sanctioned events, and forfeiture of 50% of total Masterpoints for both parties. They will be members “Not in Good Standing” during the period of their discipline.

DECISION OF APPELLATE COMMITTEE

<input type="checkbox"/>	Remanded for rehearing	Disciplinary Body expected to rehear.	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Decision of the original hearing committee is upheld.		
<input type="checkbox"/>	Decision of the original hearing committee is amended as described below:		
	Discipline	Beginning	Ending
<input type="checkbox"/>	Reprimand	N/A	N/A
<input type="checkbox"/>	Probation		
<input type="checkbox"/>	Suspension		
<input type="checkbox"/>	Other	N/A	N/A
	Please describe other decision below:		

RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED (CHAIRMAN)

/s/ Tim White		Date:	2/23/2023
Electronic Signature (type name above)	Wet Signature (sign above)		