



IS THIS AN AUTOMATIC REVIEW OR APPEAL OR BOTH Automatic Review

CHECK THE APPELLANT (party who filed the appeal)

<input type="checkbox"/>	Disciplined Party	Samuel Baskinger	ACBL #	O184375	Disciplined Party	Judy Rothstein	ACBL #	K501546
<input type="checkbox"/>	Charging Party	McKenzie Myers	ACBL #		Location of Hearing	Web-Conference using Zoom		
Appellate Body		Appeals and Charges Committee				Date of Hearing	12/19/2023	
Original Disciplinary Body		Online Ethical Oversight Committee				Date of Hearing	10/9/2023	
Original Complainant		Jeff Edelstein	ACBL #	Q799024	Effective date of the CDR consulted		May 1, 2020	

DISCIPLINE BEING APPEALED OR REVIEWED

Disciplined Party	Discipline	Beginning Date	Ending Date
Both parties	Suspension, 2 years	11/13/2023	11/12/2025
Both parties	Probation, 2 years	11/13/2025	11/12/2027
Both parties	Members not in good standing	11/13/2023	11/12/2027
Both parties	Forfeiture of 50% of total Masterpoints.		
Additional comments or description regarding discipline being appealed or reviewed			

BASIS FOR APPEAL (skip this section if this is an Automatic Review)

<input type="checkbox"/>	Decision not supported by the weight of evidence.
<input type="checkbox"/>	Procedures were inconsistent with CDR which affected the substantial rights of Appellant or undermined the confidence in the integrity or fairness of the disciplinary process.
<input type="checkbox"/>	Discipline inappropriate.
<input type="checkbox"/>	One or more person(s) on the hearing panel had bias (objection to such bias was raised at the hearing).

COMMITTEE MEMBERS WHO REVIEWED THE MATTER OR HEARD THE APPEAL

Name	ACBL #	Name	ACBL #
Tim White, Chairman	M029585		
Dennis Carman	O828450		
Deana Liddy	P205082		
Larry Sealy	P541643		

ALSO PRESENT (include web-conference (WC), in person (P), telephonic (TP), etc. and include their capacity as witness, expert, etc.)

Name	ACBL #	Via	Capacity	Name	ACBL#	Via	Capacity
Jeff Edelstein	O200338	WC	CoAdv-Charging P				
Justin Coniglio	Q809461	WC	CoAdv-Charging P				

N/A

COMMITTEE FINDINGS OF FACT (based on the evidence, state the committee’s conclusion as to what happened)

In the Matter of Samuel Baskinger and Judy Rothstein, the Committee upheld the finding of the OEOC Panel that they violated CDR 3.20 Cheating and other Ethical Violations (CDR effective May 1, 2020).

In consideration of proportionality with disciplines imposed on other pairs of similar experience, the Committee modified the discipline imposed by the OEOC panel. Mr. Baskinger and Ms. Rothstein will each be suspended for a period of three years beginning November 13, 2023. Each will serve a period of three years probation following their suspension. Each will forfeit 50% of their total Masterpoint® holding (Mr. Baskinger 6,201.73 total holding and Ms. Rothstein 10,015.11 total holding as of the date of the Recorder Complaint). They will be members “Not in Good Standing” during the period of their discipline.

DECISION OF APPELLATE COMMITTEE

<input type="checkbox"/>	Remanded for rehearing	Disciplinary Body expected to rehear.	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Decision of the original hearing committee is upheld.		
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Decision of the original hearing committee is amended as described below:		
	Discipline	Beginning	Ending
<input type="checkbox"/>	Reprimand	N/A	N/A
<input type="checkbox"/>	Probation	11/13/2026	11/12/2029
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Suspension	11/13/2023	11/12/2026
<input type="checkbox"/>	Other	N/A	N/A
	Please describe other decision below:		
	The Committee modified the discipline imposed by the OEOC panel. Mr. Baskinger and Ms. Rothstein will each be suspended for a period of three years beginning November 13, 2023. Each will serve a period of three years probation following their suspension.		

RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED (CHAIRMAN)

/s/ Tim White		Date:	12/20/2023
Electronic Signature (type name above)	Wet Signature (sign above)		