

APPEAL	NABC+ THIRTEEN
Subject	Unauthorized Information (UI) - Tempo
DIC	Gary Zeiger
Event	NABC Swiss Teams
Session	First Qualifying
Date	July 26, 2008

BD#	9
VUL	E/W
DLR	North

Ron Smith	
♠	Q 9 5 3 2
♥	J 7 3
♦	T 6
♣	J T 2

Karen Barret		Summer 2008 Las Vegas, NV	Anne Dawson	
♠	A 8		♠	K J
♥	Q T 8 6 4		♥	
♦	A Q 9 5 2		♦	K 8 7 4
♣	4		♣	A K Q 9 8 6 3

Linda Smith	
♠	T 7 6 4
♥	A K 9 5 2
♦	J 3
♣	7 5

West	North	East	South
	Pass	2♣	Pass
2♦ ¹	Pass	3♣	Pass
3♦	Pass	4♦	Pass
4♠	Pass	5♦ ²	Pass
6♦	Pass	Pass	Pass

Final Contract	6♦ by West
Opening Lead	♥A
Table Result	Made 7, E/W +1390
Director Ruling	6♦ by W made 7, E/W +1390
Committee Ruling	6♦ by W made 7, E/W +1390

(1)	Alerted – artificial game force.
(2)	Slow.

The Facts: The director was called after the hand. The 5♦ call was agreed to have been made in a slower tempo than the other calls.

The Ruling: The director judged that passing 5♦ was not a logical alternative (LA) in light of the fact that partner opened a strong 2♣ and had supported diamonds. Therefore, in accordance with Laws 16A2 and 12C2 the table result of 6♦ by West, making seven, E/W plus 1390 was allowed to stand.

The Appeal: In screening, it was agreed that East took a significant amount of time before bidding 5♦. E/W estimated the time taken to be 15 seconds and N/S judged it to be 45 seconds. East was the only player not attending the hearing.

E/W were playing a unique system built around losing trick count. They had explained that they opened some eight-counts and passed other hands with thirteen HCP. N/S were surprised at a 2♣ opening with only 16 HCP and no major. East's hesitation suggested that West bid on. N/S questioned whether E/W might have been off two heart tricks.

E/W's requirements for a 2♣ opening with an unbalanced hand are 16+ HCP with three losers or 22+ HCP with four losers. They could open 2♣ with a balanced hand and five losers and 22+ HCP, in which case the opener would rebid 2NT. Since East had shown an unbalanced hand with diamond length and West covered two losers in diamonds, it was impossible for the hands to contain two losers, and automatic for West to bid on.

The Decision: The committee attempted to construct hands meeting E/W's requirements for a 2♣ opening that might lack a heart control. It was unable to come anywhere close (within the context of West's hand and the auction to that point). Thus, it agreed that passing 5♦ was not a LA action. Therefore the table result of 6♦ by West, making seven, E/W plus 1390 was allowed to stand.

The committee discussed the merit of the appeal. It decided that N/S's unfamiliarity with E/W's unusual system was sufficient for them to avoid receiving an appeal without merit warning (AWMW).

The Committee: Doug Doub (Chair), Abby Heitner, Jacob Morgan and Aaron Silverstein.

Commentary:

- Goldsmith** What does the system have to do with anything? Partner opens 2♣ and you have two aces, two queens, and a fit. You aren't stopping short of slam. N/S should look at West's hand and realize their appeal is silly, and the committee should tell them that in no uncertain terms. This is the sort of case that AWMWs are designed to inhibit.
- Polisner** Very good work by all.
- Rigal** Merit? We don't need no stinking merit! I certainly don't see any merit here to the appeal. Anyone who suggests that West might pass 5♦ needs their head (or conscience) examined.
- Smith** I don't think N/S should have brought this appeal.
- Wildavsky** I see no merit to the appeal. Before proceeding N/S ought to have attempted to construct a hand for East where, from West's point of view, slam would be an underdog. Not being able to do so they might have realized they had no case. N/S expressed surprise that East could be so weak. Had East held a stronger hand, though, slam could only have been better.
- Wolff** AWMWs have a bad taste in my mouth so will not be discussed, but any N/S who didn't think West had her bid should apologize to them and the committee. Also East must be made to realize that a hesitation by her followed by pass will always be severely scrutinized.